## BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF SOUTH CAROLINA DOCKET NO. 2003-326-C

T	N	R	$\mathbf{E}$	

Analysis of Continued Availability of Unbundled	,
Local Switching for Mass Market Customers	,
Pursuant to the Federal Communication	,
Commission's Triennial Review Order	,
	Ì

## SOUTH CAROLINA NET, INC.'S OBJECTIONS AND RESPONSES TO BELLSOUTH'S FIRST REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS (1-21)

South Carolina Net, Inc. ("SC Net"), pursuant to the South Carolina Rules of Civil Procedure, the South Carolina Public Service Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure (S.C. Code of Regulations R. 103-800, *et seq.*), and Commission Order No. 2003-730 ("Procedural Order"), objects generally and specifically to BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.'s ("BellSouth") First Requests for Production of Documents ("BellSouth's Requests") to SC Net, served on December 8, 2003 as described below, and provides the responses to BellSouth's Requests as set forth below.

SC Net reserves the right to amend, supplement, or revise these objections, and assert additional objections, should SC Net discover additional grounds for objecting at any time prior to hearing.

## **General Objections to BellSouth's Requests**

1. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent that they are overly broad, lack specificity, are unduly burdensome or excessively time-consuming, or are irrelevant and not

likely to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence pursuant to the Procedural Order, the South Carolina Rules of Civil Procedure, or applicable South Carolina law.

- 2. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent that they seek discovery of information protected by attorney-client privilege, the work product doctrine, the accountant-client privilege, or any other applicable privilege.
- 3. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent that they purport to impose discovery obligations on SC Net beyond the scope of what is permitted under the Procedural Order, the South Carolina Rules of Civil Procedure, or applicable South Carolina law.
- 4. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent that they purport to seek discovery of matters other than those subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission pursuant to the Federal Communications Commission's ("FCC") Triennial Review Order ("TRO") or applicable South Carolina law.
- 5. SC Net objects to all Requests that require the disclosure of information that already is in the public domain, that is in the possession of BellSouth or is readily obtainable by BellSouth, or that is otherwise on record with the Commission or the FCC.
- 6. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent that they seek information and discovery of facts known and opinions held by experts acquired and/or developed in anticipation of litigation or for hearing and outside the scope of discoverable information pursuant to the South Carolina Rules of Civil Procedure or applicable South Carolina law.
- 7. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent that they request specific financial, business or proprietary information regarding SC Net's economic business model, on the grounds that those requests presume that the market entry analysis is contingent upon SC

South Carolina Net, Inc. SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C

BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

Net's economic business model instead of the hypothetical business model contemplated by the

TRO.

8. SC Net objects to BellSouth's definitions of "hot cut," "batch hot cut,"

"individual hot cut," "coordinated cut over" and "coordinated time-specific cut over" and each

and every request that includes such terms, as such definitions are vague and not adequately

defined in that it is not clear whether or to what extent BellSouth's practices are consistent with

the FCC's use of such terms. The reference in BellSouth's definition of "hot cut" to the "entire

process" is vague in that it is not clear whether this includes number portability or whether it is

limited to the physical process of transferring a customer. The term "batch" is vague in that it

is unclear how many lines or customers constitute a "batch" or whether conversion of a single

customer with several accounts would constitute a "batch." BellSouth's use of the term

"individual hot cut" is vague in that it is defined with reference to "batch hot cuts," which is

itself vague and ambiguous. BellSouth's definitions of "coordinated cut over" and

"coordinated time-specific cut over" are vague and ambiguous. The distinctions among

BellSouth's definitions for "hot cuts," "individual hot cuts," "coordinated cut overs" and

coordinated time-specific cut overs" are unclear. Thus, such discovery is over broad and it

would be unduly burdensome for SC Net to respond to such ambiguous discovery. SC Net

further objects to BellSouth's use of such terms as they apply to BellSouth's individual hot cut

process as SC Net is not privy to each and every process or procedure employed by BellSouth

in implementing such hot cuts.

9. SC Net objects to BellSouth's definition of "business case" as vague and

overly broad.

South Carolina Net, Inc. SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C

BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

10. SC Net objects to BellSouth's definition of "voice grade equivalent lines" as

vague and ambiguous and subject to differing interpretations.

11. SC Net objects to the definitions for "qualifying service" and "non-qualifying

service," and each and every request that includes such terms, as SC Net does not use such

terms in the ordinary course of business and answering in these terms would require SC Net to

provide a legal interpretation of the FCC's terms. With the exception of the specific services

the FCC has designated as qualifying or non-qualifying, the term is not clearly defined by the

FCC or by BellSouth. For example, as the FCC stated in footnote 466 of the TRO, "Our list is

intended to identify general categories of services that would quality as eligible services. It is

not intended to be an exhaustive list or to identify services in a more particular manner." Thus,

such discovery is overly broad and it would be unduly burdensome for SC Net to respond to

such ambiguous discovery.

12. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent they seek information

related to special access circuits purchased out of BellSouth's interstate tariff rather than to

unbundled network elements.

13. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent that the information

requested constitutes "trade secrets" or to the extent that the information requested would

require the disclosure of customer specific information.

14. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent that they seek information

regarding SC Net's operations in ILEC service areas other than BellSouth ILEC service areas

within the State of South Carolina, as such information is irrelevant to BellSouth's case in this

docket and such discovery is overly broad and unduly burdensome.

15. SC Net objects to BellSouth's Requests to the extent they seek information regarding SC Net's projections regarding future services, revenues, marketing, strategies, equipment deployments, or other such future business plans, as such information constitutes trade secrets and, for purposes of this proceeding, would be highly speculative and irrelevant to

the issues to be decided in this docket. Moreover, SC Net's future plans are irrelevant because

the TRO concerns a hypothetical CLEC.

**RESPONSES** 

Subject to the foregoing objections, SC Net respectfully submits the following responses

to the BellSouth Requests. In each instance, the foregoing general objections are restated,

adopted and incorporated as if set forth verbatim in response to each and every request for the

production of documents. In addition, to the extent a particular request corresponds or relates to

one of the 84 interrogatories propounded in BellSouth's First Set of Interrogatories served on SC

Net on December 8, 2003, the specific objections stated in response to that interrogatory are

incorporated by reference herein in response to the particular request for production.

SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

**REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION** 

1. Produce all documents identified in your responses to BellSouth's First Set of

Interrogatories.

**RESPONSE:** 

The only documents identified in response to BellSouth's First Set of Interrogatories are tariffs,

which are on file with the Public Service Commission of South Carolina and are available to the

public.

2. Produce every business case in your possession, custody or control that evaluates,

discusses, analyzes or otherwise refers or relates to the offering of a qualifying service in the

State of South Carolina.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 9, 11, 13, 14, and 15

as if set forth herein verbatim.

6

SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C

BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

3. Produce all documents referring or relating to the average monthly revenues you receive

from end user customers in South Carolina to whom you only provide qualifying service.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 7, 11, 13, and 14 as if set forth

herein verbatim.

4. Produce all documents referring or relating to the average number of access lines you

provide to end user customers in South Carolina to whom you only provide qualifying service.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 7, 11, 13, and 14 as if set forth

herein verbatim.

5. Produce all documents referring or relating to the average monthly revenues you receive

from end user customers in South Carolina to whom you only provide nonqualifying service.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 7, 11, 13, and 14 as if set forth

herein verbatim.

7

SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C

BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

6. Produce all documents referring or relating to the average monthly revenues you receive

from end user customers in South Carolina to whom you provide both qualifying and non-

qualifying service.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 7, 11, 13, and 14 as if set forth

herein verbatim.

7. Produce all documents referring or relating to the average number of access lines you

provide to end user customers in South Carolina to whom you provide both qualifying and non-

qualifying service.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 7, 11, 13, and 14 as if set forth

herein verbatim.

8

SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C

BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

8. Provide all documents referring or relating to the classifications used by Company to

offer service to end user customers in South Carolina (e.g., residential customers, small business

customers, mass market customers, enterprise customers, and/or any other type of classification

that you use to classify your customers).

**RESPONSE:** 

Such classifications are set forth in SC Net's tariffs, which are on file with the Public Service

Commission of South Carolina and are available to the public.

9. Produce all documents referring or relating to the average acquisition cost for each class

or type of end user customer served by Company, as requested in BellSouth's First Set of

Interrogatories, Interrogatory No. 34.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 9, 11, 13, 14, and 15

as if set forth herein verbatim.

9

SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C

BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

10. Produce all documents referring or relating to the typical churn for each class or type of

end user customer served by Company, as requested in BellSouth's First Set of Interrogatories,

Interrogatory No. 35.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net does not possess any such documents.

11. Produce all documents referring or relating to how Company determines whether to serve

an individual customer's location with multiple DSOs or with a DS 1 or larger transmission

system.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net does not possess any such documents.

12. Produce all documents referring or relating to the typical or average number of DSOs at

which Company would choose to serve a particular customer with a DS 1 or larger transmission

system as opposed to multiple DSO, all other things being equal.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net does not possess any such documents.

10

SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C

BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

13. Produce all documents referring or relating to the cost of capital used by Company in

evaluating whether to offer a qualifying service in a particular geographic market.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 9, 11, 13, 14, and 15

as if set forth herein verbatim.

14. Produce all documents referring or relating to the time period used by Company in

evaluating whether to offering a qualifying service in a particular geographic market (e.g., one

year, five years, ten years or some other time horizon over which an offering of qualifying

service(s) is evaluated)?

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 9, 11, 13, 14, and 15

as if set forth herein verbatim.

15. Produce all documents referring or relating to your estimates of sales expense when

evaluating whether to offer a qualifying service in a particular geographic market.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 9, 11, 13, 14, and 15

as if set forth herein verbatim.

11

SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C

BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

16. Produce all documents referring or relating to your estimates of general and

administrative (G&A) expenses when evaluating whether to offer a qualifying service in a

particular geographic market.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net restates, adopts and incorporates its General Objections 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 9, 11, 13, 14, and 15

as if set forth herein verbatim.

17. Produce all documents referring or relating to any complaints by Company or its end user

customers about individual hot cuts performed by BellSouth since January 1, 2000.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net does not possess any such documents.

18. Produce all documents referring or relating to a batch hot cut process used by any ILEC

in the BellSouth region that is acceptable to Company or that Company believes is superior to

BellSouth's batch hot cut process.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net does not possess any such documents.

12

SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C

BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

19. Produce all documents referring or relating to an individual hot cut process used by any

ILEC in the BellSouth region that is acceptable to Company or that Company believes is

superior to BellSouth's individual hot cut process.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net does not possess any such documents.

20. Produce all documents referring or relating to a batch hot cut process used by any ILEC

outside the BellSouth region that is acceptable to Company or that Company believes is superior

to BellSouth's batch hot cut process.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net does not possess any such documents.

21. Produce all documents referring or relating to an individual hot cut process used by any

ILEC outside the BellSouth region that is acceptable to Company or that Company believes is

superior to BellSouth's individual hot cut process.

**RESPONSE:** 

SC Net does not possess any such documents.

South Carolina Net, Inc. SCPSC Docket No. 2003-326-C BellSouth's First Requests for the Production of Documents

Respectfully submitted this 14th day of January, 2004.

/s/

M. John Bowen, Jr.
Margaret M. Fox
MCNAIR LAW FIRM, P.A.
Post Office Box 11390
Columbia, South Carolina 29211
(803) 799-9800

ATTORNEYS FOR SOUTH CAROLINA NET, INC.

Columbia, South Carolina